Cal-OAR: Program Management in the Spirit of Continuous Quality Improvement

PRESENTED BY THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SERVICES
Presenters

• Julianna Vignalats, CalWORKs Program Improvement and Performance Section Chief

• Michael Billingsley, CalWORKs Research Data Analyst II
Today’s Agenda

• Cal-OAR Background
• Performance Measures and Data
• Cal-OAR Data Dashboard Demo
• CalWORKs Continuous Quality Improvement (Cal-CQI)
• What’s Next
• Cal-OAR Website and Available Resources
Cal-OAR Background
Cal-OAR Performance Measures

- Phased in during first three-year cycle
- Existing Reporting, Phase 1 and Phase 2 Measures
- First three-year cycle focused on Early Engagement
Performance Measures and Data
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cal-OAR Performance Measures: Existing Reporting**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment Rate of Current CalWORKs Individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wage Progression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post CalWORKs Employment Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate of Exits with Earnings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate of Program Reentries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate of Program Reentries After Exit with Earnings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intergenerational CalWORKs Enrollment Rate (state level only)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CDSS will obtain data through existing data sources outside of the SAWS – no new reporting for counties**
## Cal-OAR Performance Measures: Phase One

| Measure                                                        |
|                                                               |
| Engagement Rate                                              |
| Sanction Rate                                                 |
| Sanction Resolution Rate                                      |
| Orientation Attendance Rate                                   |
| OCAT/Appraisal Completion Timeliness Rate                     |
| First Activity Attendance Rate                                |
| Improved Literacy, Basic Skills, English Language Acquisition Rate** |
| Community College Progress Rate**                            |

**CDSS will obtain data through existing data sources outside of the SAWS – no new reporting for counties**
## Cal-OAR Performance Measures: Phase Two

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OCAT/Appraisal to Next Activity Timeliness Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and Skills Development Access Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and Skills Development Utilization Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Care Access Rate**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homeless Assistance and Housing Support Program Access Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ancillary Services Access Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Provision Timeliness Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsidized to Unsubsidized Employment Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Completion Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Visiting Transitions to WTW Engagement Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Stabilization Transitions to WTW Engagement Rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CDSS is working with CDE to obtain child care data**
Cal-OAR Performance Measures
County B

Chart 1: Wage Progression
Cohort 1: Median Earnings During the Quarter

- Former WTW individuals in Cohort 1 exited CalWORKs between October and December 2017. The earnings above represent the total quarterly earnings. "Entry QTR" is the quarter the individual entered the program. "PQ2" is the second quarter after program exit. "PQ4" is the fourth quarter after program exit.

Chart 2: Wage Progression
Cohort 2: Median Earnings During the Quarter

- Former WTW individuals in Cohort 2 exited CalWORKs between April and June 2018. The earnings above represent the total quarterly earnings. "Entry QTR" is the quarter the individual entered the program. "PQ2" is the second quarter after program exit.

Chart 3: Post CalWORKs Employment Rate
Cohort 1: Employment Rate During the Quarter

- Former WTW individuals in Cohort 1 exited CalWORKs between October and December 2017. "Entry QTR" is the quarter the individual entered the program. "PQ2" is the second quarter after program exit. "PQ4" is the fourth quarter after program exit.

Chart 4: Post CalWORKs Employment Rate
Cohort 2: Employment Rate During the Quarter

- Former WTW individuals in Cohort 2 exited CalWORKs between April and June 2018. "PQ2" is the second quarter after program exit.

Chart 5: Program Reentries

- WTW individuals that exited CalWORKs between October and December 2017, and returned to CalWORKs within 12 months after their exit.

Chart 6: Program Reentries After Exit with Earnings

- WTW individuals that exited CalWORKs between October and December 2017 with earnings, and returned to CalWORKs within 12 months after their exit.
Adults that received CalWORKs aid for at least one month between July and December 2018, who also received at least one month of CalWORKs assistance as children (under the age of 18).

WTW individuals that exited CalWORKs with earnings between October and December 2018.

WTW individuals that exited CalWORKs with earnings between October and December 2018.

Employment Rate of WTW individuals between October and December 2018.

Employment Rate of Current CalWORKs Individuals.

Intergenerational CalWORKs Enrollment.

*Adults that received CalWORKs aid for at least one month between July and December 2018, who also received at least one month of CalWORKs assistance as children (under the age of 18).
Example 1: Employment Rate of Current CalWORKs Individuals

**Numerator:** Current WTW Individuals with a wage record in EDD

**Denominator:** Current WTW Individuals

**Data Sources:** MEDS and EDD

**Frequency of Calculation:** Quarterly

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jan-Mar</td>
<td>Apr-June</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Employment Rate of Current CalWORKs Individuals
Data matching: Employment Rate of Current CalWORKs Individuals

Step 1: CDSS uses MEDS to identify the measure’s population of interest. The individual must be a current WTW individual.

Step 2: CDSS matches the population from MEDS to EDD data to determine who had reported earnings during the specified time period. SSN is used to link the two data sources.
Employment Rate of Current CalWORKs Individuals

- County A: 35.6%
- Statewide: 38.0%
Example 2: Post CalWORKs Employment Rate

**Numerator:** Of the Denominator, former Welfare-to-Work individuals with wages in the measurement quarter

**Denominator:** Welfare-to-Work individuals that exited CalWORKs within the exit cohort period

**Data Sources:** MEDS and EDD

**Frequency of Calculation:** Quarterly

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jan-Mar</td>
<td>Apr-June</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post CalWORKs Employment Rate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohort 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohort 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data matching: Post CalWORKs Employment Rate

Step 1:
CDSS uses MEDS to identify the measure’s population of interest. The individual must:
- Exit the CalWORKs program in the specified time period...
- with a welfare-to-work aid code at the time of exit

Step 2:
CDSS matches the population from MEDS to EDD data to determine who had reported earnings during the specified time period. SSN is used to link the two data sources.
Post CalWORKs Employment Rate

**COHORT 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>County A</th>
<th>Statewide</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PQ2</td>
<td>53.9%</td>
<td>53.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQ4</td>
<td>54.2%</td>
<td>53.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**COHORT 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>County A</th>
<th>Statewide</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PQ2</td>
<td>53.0%</td>
<td>53.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example 3: Rate of Program Reentries

**Numerator:** WTW Individuals that reenter the program in any month during the 12-month period following exit

**Denominator:** WTW Individuals that exited CalWORKs within the exit cohort period

**Data Source:** MEDS

**Frequency of Calculation:** Monthly

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jan-Mar</td>
<td>Apr-June</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate of Program Reentries</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

19
Data matching: Rate of Program Reentries

MEDS → CDSS → Counties

Calculate Measure
Rate of Program Reentries
Data Validation

• **Data Validation is a crucial step** in the Cal-OAR process
  - Get the data right, at the start of Cal-OAR
  - Create confidence
  - Avoid ongoing need to validate individual level data

• **Upfront data validation** process with 8 counties
  - Phase 1: Fall 2019
  - Phase 2: 2020
Data Validation – County Participants

- Shasta
- Colusa
- Kings
- Los Angeles
- San Francisco
- San Bernardino
- Ventura
- Placer
SAWS produces Cal-OAR data files with phase 1 elements

CDSS determines sample parameters and identifies sample cases from the data files

County/CDSS work together to check sample case data elements against information in case records

If results match:
Data validation complete

OR

If results do not match:
CDSS to work with SAWS/counties on specific variables that do not match

Cal-OAR Upfront Data Validation Process
Data Validation Collaboration Structure

• CDSS staff will bring a sample of the phase 1 Cal-OAR performance measure data to the county
• CDSS and the county staff will look up each person from the sample data set in the county case management system
• CDSS and the county staff will compare the data reported from SAWS and what is seen in the county’s case management system
• This will be done for each variable
Data Validation Collaboration Structure

• CDSS and county staff will debrief with SAWS during the visit to discuss any questions or issues

• If a data variable(s) does not match: CDSS, the county, and SAWS will work together to determine why it does not match and if an adjustment to the data file coding is needed.

• CDSS and participating counties will share back results of the validation process with other counties during Cal-OAR Forum calls and during the 2019 CalWORKs Training Academy
Data Dashboard
Drawing out Data Narratives:

Cal-OAR Data Dashboard
## County Demographic Profile

### Educational Attainment and Median Earnings

**Educational Attainment**

Highest Attainment for the Population 25 years and over

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>California</th>
<th>Los Angeles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 9th grade</td>
<td>9.7%</td>
<td>12.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9th to 12th grade, no diploma</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school graduate (includes equivalenc..)</td>
<td>20.6%</td>
<td>20.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some college, no degree</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>19.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate’s degree</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s degree</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate or professional degree</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
<td>10.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*2013-2017 American Community Survey (5-year estimates), Social Characteristics, Table P02

**Median Earnings by Educational Attainment**

for the Population 25 years and over

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Attainment</th>
<th>California</th>
<th>Los Angeles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than high school graduate</td>
<td>$21,252</td>
<td>$27,308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school graduate (..)</td>
<td>$30,036</td>
<td>$35,926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some college or Associate degree</td>
<td>$37,169</td>
<td>$52,851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s degree</td>
<td>$59,709</td>
<td>$75,564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate or professional degree</td>
<td>$82,943</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*2013-2017 American Community Survey (5-year estimates): Educational Attainment, Table S1501
CalWORKs Continuous Quality Improvement (Cal-CQI)
Cal-CQI Process

CQI moves us through a logical process to ask…

How are we doing?

What can be done better?
County Self-Assessment (Cal-CSA)

• Comprehensively assess county CalWORKs program
• Identify strengths and challenges
• Describe how local operational decisions and systemic factors affect outcomes
Cal-CSA Structure

• Executive Summary
• Demographics
• Agency Characteristics
• Stakeholder Engagement and Feedback
• Barrier Removal
• Performance Measures
Cal-CSA Template

• Automated template to guide counties through the analytical process in a stepwise manner
• Pre-populated with demographic and performance measure data
• Same required analytical questions for all counties
• Optional analytical questions depending on county’s unique situation (context) and performance measure rates
Sample Cal-CSA Analytical Questions

Describe the strengths and needs of the communities served.

The number and locations of CalWORKs offices. Specify urban versus rural. For each office specify: operations, service array, and other services offered (i.e. other human service or workforce programs).

What service/partnership gaps currently exist? What impact does that have on service delivery, and what strategies or long-term plans does the county have to address these gaps?

Discuss the client’s experience at the CalWORKs office, include: average wait time, security, play area for children, etc.

Are any barrier removal service providers co-located at county offices; describe.

Explore whether measure performance varies by key demographic points.

Outcomes are often related – practice changes that lead to improvement in one measure may impact the county’s performance on other measures. What other performance measures might impact these measures?
Sample Cal-CSA Analytical Questions specific to Employment Related Measures

- Describe the county’s process for engaging employed WTW clients. What does case management look like for employed clients, and how does it differ from case management for unemployed clients?
- What percentage of employed CalWORKs clients have unsubsidized employment, subsidized employment, and self-employment?
- Describe the county’s partnerships with local labor boards.
- How do former clients’ median earnings compare to the overall county population’s median earnings?
- Compare former clients’ median earnings to the federal poverty threshold, the California poverty measure, and the county living wage.
- Describe the county’s post aid job retention services, if applicable, and what are the most common services utilized.
System-Improvement Plan (Cal-SIP)

- County plan for improving their CalWORKs program
- Performance measures for focused improvement
- Improvement strategies
Progress Report

• Update on performance measures and strategy implementation
• Success and barriers in reaching performance goals
• Identification of strategy adjustments
Cal-OAR Peer Review

• Share promising and best practices
• Discuss and brainstorm ideas to innovate and refine county CalWORKs programs
• Discuss successes and challenges
• Troubleshoot road blocks
• Develop solutions with peer counties
Cal-OAR Peer Review

Cal-CSA → Cal-SIP → Progress Report

1. Peer Review
2. Peer Review
Customer Satisfaction Survey

• Administered three times (touchpoints):
  1. Orientation
  2. Assessment
  3. Redetermination

• Two parts
  A. Specific to each touchpoint
  B. General questions asked in each survey
What’s Next
Next Steps…

• Cal-CQI Resources
  • Cal-CQI Instruction Manual – Fall 2019
  • Cal-CSA Template – Winter 2020
  • Toolkits

• In-Person Regional Training – Jan – April 2020

• County/CDSS Coaching – Begins Feb – May 2020
## Cal-CQI: Reporting Cohorts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COHORT 1 DUE DATES</th>
<th>COHORT 2 DUE DATES</th>
<th>COHORT 3 DUE DATES</th>
<th>COHORT 4 DUE DATES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cal-SIP Final: 2/19/21</td>
<td>Cal-SIP Final: 3/19/21</td>
<td>Cal-SIP Final: 4/16/21</td>
<td>Cal-SIP Final: 5/14/21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Fresno
- Los Angeles
- Mariposa
- Orange
- Riverside
- San Francisco
- Santa Clara
- Solano
- Yolo

- Alameda
- Amador
- Butte
- Calaveras
- Humboldt
- Inyo
- Madera
- San Joaquin
- San Luis Obispo
- Santa Barbara
- Shasta
- Stanislaus
- Tehama
- Trinity
- Tulare
- Tuolumne
- Ventura

- Colusa
- Contra Costa
- Glenn
- Kern
- Kings
- Lake
- Marin
- Mendocino
- Merced
- Monterey
- Napa
- San Benito
- San Bernardino
- San Mateo
- Santa Cruz
- Sonoma

- Alpine
- Del Norte
- El Dorado
- Imperial
- Lassen
- Modoc
- Mono
- Nevada
- Placer
- Plumas
- Sacramento
- San Diego
- Sierra
- Siskiyou
- Sutter
- Yuba
Cal-OAR Website and Resources
Available Resources

Cal-OAR website
https://www.cdss.ca.gov/inforesources/CalWORKs/Cal-OAR

Cal-OAR performance measures

Cal-OAR data dashboard
https://www.cdss.ca.gov/inforesources/CalWORKs/Cal-OAR/Cal-OAR-Data-Dashboard

Cal-OAR Inbox Cal-OAR@dss.ca.gov
Question and Answer